QRA Model for Dangerous Goods Transport through Road Tunnels

Developed under the joint OECD-PIARC ERS2 project

Contents

- Objectives of the QRA Model
- Calculations and data requirements
- Examples
- Testing and application history
- Dissemination and Support
QRA Objectives

- Compare risks due to Dangerous Goods (DG) transport for alternative routes
- Compare DG risks with acceptability criteria
- Evaluate tunnel regulations for DG traffic
- Evaluate tunnel equipment options

QRA Model produces F-N curves

- Number of Casualties
- Cumulative Frequency (= 1 / Return Period)

10 fatalities incident every 1000 years
150 fatalities incident every 10,000 years
How are F-N curves produced?

- Assessment of all situations is impossible...  
  ... simplification is necessary

Methodology
- Small number of representative DG scenarios
- Accident frequencies
- Physical consequences in open and within tunnel(s)
- Physiological effects on people
- Take account of escape and sheltering
- Calculate risk of death or injury

Representative DG scenarios

1. Empty / non-combustible load
2. Combustible load
3. LPG
4. Motor spirit
5. Motor spirit
6. Chlorine
7. LPG
8. LPG
9. LPG
10. Ammonia
11. Acrolein
12. Acrolein
13. Non-flammable liquefied gas
Input data - Routes and Tunnels

- **Routes**
  - defined in sections
  - constant carriageway geometry, traffic and accident rate
- **Tunnel**
  - defined in sections of constant geometry and ventilation
  - ventilation (*may need specialist help for complex tunnels*)
  - drainage
  - emergency egress (warning systems, spacing of exits)
  - structural parameters (lining, overburden, fire rating)

Input data - Traffic

- **Traffic flow**
  - defined for each route section, traffic direction and time period
  - vehicle mix (light vehicles, buses/coaches, HGVs)
  - traffic speeds
- **Dangerous Goods vehicles**
  - DG traffic flow
  - proportions of different classes of dangerous goods
Input data - Accident Frequencies

- HGV accident rates
  - according to road type, speed limit, etc
  - default data provided from France, Canada and Norway
  - use correct national or local statistics where available
- Apply correction factor for DG vehicles
- Conditional probability of DG scenario, once a DG vehicle is involved in an accident

Input data - Population & Meteorology

- Population density
  - grid-based data
  - according to period (day/night)
- Wind data
  - frequency according to:
    - wind speed
    - direction
    - stability class
Hazard Analysis

- **Fire**
  - HGV or hydrocarbon pool fire, radiant heat and smoke spread

- **VCE (Vapour Cloud Explosion)**
  - liquid release, evaporation, gas dispersion, ignition, blast effects

- **BLEVE (Boiling Liquid Expanding Vapour Explosion)**
  - catastrophic failure of tank heated by fire, blast and fireball effects

- **Toxic release**
  - dispersion of toxic gas cloud along tunnel or in open air

Lethality Ranges

- **Tunnels**

- **Open air**
Casualty Analysis

- Lethality ranges
  - hazard ranges for radiant heat, toxic concentration & overpressure
  - exposure duration
  - hazardous dose
  - probit equations
  - % fatalities (and/or injuries)

- Population
  - road users and/or local population
  - possibility of escape and sheltering

- Number of fatalities = %fatalities x people present

QRA Model Software

- Software
  - based on Microsoft Excel with Visual Basic programming
  - data entry screens to assist the user
  - User Manual data preparation, entry and processing
  - Reference Manual theoretical basis and examples

- Latest release
  - QRAM v3.60 released 2003
Example 1 - Compare Routes

- 6 shipments of bulk chlorine East-to-West every day
- 6 shipments of bulk bromine West-to-East every day
- Dual carriageway coastal route passing through 3 tunnels
- Single carriageway through mountainous region
- Which route is safer?

Example 1 - Comparison of F-N Curves

- Route via tunnels
- Alternative open route
Example 1 - Route Conclusions

- Risks along alternative (open) route greater than risks along tunnel route
  - chlorine risk dominates along open route
  - HGV fire risk dominates in tunnels
  - larger number of people at risk along open route

Example 2 - Acceptability Criteria

- Compare DG risks with acceptability criteria
  - criteria are specific to country and application
  - subjective issues (risk aversion, etc)
Example 3 - Evaluate Equipment Options

- Investigate ‘what if?’ scenarios
- Existing tunnel
  - 650m single bore, no emergency exits
  - no CCTV or detection systems
- Possible improvements to reduce risks during prolonged contraflow traffic operations
  - install additional escape route(s)
  - upgrade detection/surveillance
  - upgrade traffic control and communications

Example 3 - QRA Results for Options

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traffic</th>
<th>Tunnel ventilation</th>
<th>Upgrade detection &amp; communications</th>
<th>Fatalities/year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single direction</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bi-directional</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bi-directional</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single direction</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Software Evaluation and Usage

- Evaluation studies
  - Austria, France, Netherlands, Norway
  - Spain, Sweden, Switzerland
  - Germany (trial pending)
- Practical studies
  - France (20 studies) regulatory role
  - Greece (1 study) possible regulatory role
  - UK (3 studies)

Dissemination and Support

- Responsibilities
  - contract between PIARC and OECD
  - dissemination and support led by WG5 on behalf of C5
- Software distribution
  - CD-ROM sold (at low price to cover costs), and/or
  - freely downloadable from PIARC website
- Support
  - direct arrangement between developers and users
  - training courses
  - user group meetings
**Future Development**

- Only very limited maintenance by PIARC
- Development by users authorised
  - encouraged to make modified models available to PIARC and other users
- Future development possible through international projects or by individual countries / bodies